

Appendix 2

Worcester City Council

Appointment of Project Management and Design Consultants - Evaluation Criteria and Scoring
Post Clarification Meetings with Price Scoring based on Design Team Contracted Cost
 (i.e. Less costs to be novated to Contractor)

Number of Submissions received

Project Evaluation Weighting	Quality %	Price %
	60	40

Minimum Quality threshold (per criterion) %

Minimum Quality threshold (whole section) %

Quality Section

Section	Description	Pre-weighted Score Available	Weighting	Weighted Score Available
S2.1	Experience & Expertise	5	5	25
S2.2 a	Structure	5	0.5	2.5
S2.2 b	Main Contact	5	1	5
S2.2 c	Team Members	5	2.5	12.5
S2.3	Key Assumptions	5	1	5
S2.4 a	Project Execution Plan	5	4	20
S2.4 b	Managing Affordability	5	1	5
S2.4 c	Design Stage	5	2	10
S2.4 d	Procurement & Management of	5	2	10
S2.4 e	Innovation	5	1	5
				100
Average Quality Scored (Value)				81.50
Average Quality Scored(Points)				92.64

1 Deloitte		
PASS/FAIL	Pre-weighted Score	Weighted Score
PASS	5	25.00
PASS	4	2.00
PASS	5	5.00
PASS	5	12.50
PASS	4	4.00
PASS	3	12.00
PASS	5	5.00
PASS	5	10.00
PASS	4	8.00
PASS	4	4.00
Raw Quality Score		87.50

2 Turner Townsend		
PASS/FAIL	Pre-weighted Score	Weighted Score
PASS	4	20.00
PASS	4	2.00
PASS	4	4.00
PASS	4	10.00
PASS	3	3.00
PASS	4	16.00
PASS	5	5.00
PASS	4	8.00
PASS	5	10.00
PASS	4	4.00
Raw Quality Score		82.00

3 Lend Lease Consulting (EMEA) Ltd		
PASS/FAIL	Pre-weighted Score	Weighted Score
PASS	4	20.00
PASS	4	2.00
PASS	3	3.00
PASS	4	10.00
PASS	4	4.00
PASS	3	12.00
PASS	4	4.00
PASS	4	8.00
PASS	4	8.00
PASS	4	4.00
Raw Quality Score		75.00

1 point to be added for every 1% below average
 1 point to be deducted for every 1% above average

% Above/below average	<input type="text" value="7.36"/>
Points added/deducted	<input type="text" value="7.36"/>
Quality Section Score	<input type="text" value="100.00"/>
Quality Section Rank	<input type="text" value="1"/>

% Above/below average	<input type="text" value="0.61"/>
Points added/deducted	<input type="text" value="0.61"/>
Quality Section Score	<input type="text" value="93.25"/>
Quality Section Rank	<input type="text" value="2"/>

% Above/below average	<input type="text" value="-7.98"/>
Points added/deducted	<input type="text" value="-7.98"/>
Quality Section Score	<input type="text" value="84.66"/>
Quality Section Rank	<input type="text" value="3"/>

Price Section

Average Price Tendered (Value)
 Average Price Tendered (Points)

Tender Price

Tender Price

Tender Price

1 point to be added for every 1% below average
 1 point to be deducted for every 1% above average

% Above/below average	<input type="text" value="7.00"/>
Points added/deducted	<input type="text" value="-7.00"/>
Price Section Score	<input type="text" value="83.95"/>
Price Section Rank	<input type="text" value="3"/>

% Above/below average	<input type="text" value="-9.05"/>
Points added/deducted	<input type="text" value="9.05"/>
Price Section Score	<input type="text" value="100.00"/>
Price Section Rank	<input type="text" value="1"/>

% Above/below average	<input type="text" value="2.05"/>
Points added/deducted	<input type="text" value="-2.05"/>
Price Section Score	<input type="text" value="88.90"/>
Price Section Rank	<input type="text" value="2"/>

Overall Score Section

Project Quality Weighting x Quality Section Score
 Project Price Weighting x Price Section Score

60%	<input type="text" value="60.00"/>
40%	<input type="text" value="33.58"/>
Overall Score	<input type="text" value="93.58"/>
Overall Rank	<input type="text" value="2"/>

60%	<input type="text" value="55.95"/>
40%	<input type="text" value="40.00"/>
Overall Score	<input type="text" value="95.95"/>
Overall Rank	<input type="text" value="1"/>

60%	<input type="text" value="50.80"/>
40%	<input type="text" value="35.56"/>
Overall Score	<input type="text" value="86.36"/>
Overall Rank	<input type="text" value="3"/>

Without Quality Weighting Applied
 Price

60%	<input type="text" value="52.50"/>
40%	<input type="text" value="33.58"/>
Overall Score	<input type="text" value="86.08"/>
Overall Rank	<input type="text" value="2"/>

	<input type="text" value="49.20"/>
	<input type="text" value="40.00"/>
Overall Score	<input type="text" value="89.20"/>
Overall Rank	<input type="text" value="1"/>

	<input type="text" value="45.00"/>
	<input type="text" value="35.56"/>
Overall Score	<input type="text" value="80.56"/>
Overall Rank	<input type="text" value="3"/>